



22/08/22

Bennachie Community Council
Minutes of the Meeting held on 20th June 2022
Rannes Hall, Inch

Present: Andy Miller (Chair/Oyne), Wally Rhodes (Treasurer/Leslie), Wendy Glasspool (Sec/Chapel of Garioch), Frank Musgrave (Oyne) and Wilma McIntosh (Rayne)

Apologies: Sharon Duncan (Vice Chair / Rayne), Stuart Rennie (Planning/Insch), Hugh Fraser (Insch), Alan Simpson (Leslie), Robert Grant (Insch), Stan Averell (Culsalmond), Janette Taylor (Insch) Cllrs Smith and Cllr Grant

Visitors: Cllrs Sam Payne

Item 1 – Declarations of Interest

1. None

Item 2 – Minutes of the Last Meeting

2. It was confirmed the minutes of the last formal BCC meeting held on 25th April 22 were circulated. Andy proposed to accept the minutes, seconded by Wendy. Approved minutes to be forwarded to AC by the Sec.

Sec

Item 3 – Police Report

3. The report circulated by the Chair via email prior to the meeting (see Appendix B). No comments arose.

Item 4 – BCC Business

4. Decisions Since Last Meeting None.

5. Financial Statement Wally advised the figures were as per the AGM presented earlier in the evening: The forecast funds available for the period 2021/22 are as follows: Start Financial Year 22-23: £3776.35. Plus ABZ Grant £1181.54 Plus SSE Wayleave £213.99: Sub Total £5171.88. It was confirmed that as yet we have not received the annual grant payment from Aberdeenshire AC, which is made once the audited and approved accounts have been received by AC. Sec to forward information onto AC.

Sec

Item 5 – Roads and Transport

6. A96 Dualling The status of this project was raised as a question at Scottish Parliament with SG affirming their commitment to improving A96 journeys, safety and congestion issues. Improved transport connectivity along with bypassing affected communities where required. There is an ongoing consultation to get feedback on A96 connectivity – Frank circulated a draft BCC response – reiterating previous comments made by the BCC. Individuals are also encouraged to respond.

Item 6 - Aberdeenshire Council

7. Cllr Sam Payne gave an overview of Cllr Inductions and tour of region.

Item 7 - Chapel of Garioch

8. Thanks given to the Council for provision of the Council Flowers – which had been planted up. Numerous positive comments from the village and visitors.

Item 8 - Culsalmond

9. Stan had been in contact with Brian Strachan and advised the A96 Bus Stop design work had started. BCC awaiting update.

Item 9 - Inch

10. Insch Strategic Needs Assessment Frank presented a report on the outcome of the recent Integration Joint Board discussions on Insch Hospital. The IJB decision not to reopen in-patient beds in the existing Insch War Memorial hospital leaves us for the foreseeable future with the lowest ranked option for healthcare for Insch.

The decision-making process was flawed. The recommendations had not been seen by members of the stakeholder work group and were not representative of the collective views of the workgroup. Decision making did not follow the process proscribed by Health Improvement Scotland.

A number of issues were misrepresented in the IJB meeting on 6th June 2022. Members expressed disappointment at the IJB decision

BCC resolved to:

1. Minute observations on the IJB process (see appendix A)
2. Work with the Friends of Insch Hospital to understand the consequences of the IJB decision and to evaluate options moving forward.
3. When the Health and Social Care Partnership commence consultation on either the short term, interim arrangements or the new build options, BCC must engage with the consultation to represent the views of the community.

11. Strawberry Fayre was a great success and was very well attended. BCC stall with posters manned by Andy and Hugh.

Item 10 - Leslie

12. Nothing to report.

Item 11 - Oyne

13. Community Survey - was very well supported with results from +100 people. Draft Action plan developing. Stakeholders meeting to be arranged, ongoing issues speeding and potential pavement village hall to Kirton of Oyne (Roads Department).

Item 12 Premnay

14. No representation.

Item 13 - Rayne

15. No change re blocked drains etc.

Item 14- Planning

16. Stuart has circulated the planning applications / weekly lists in the usual way with BCC members responding via email. No further comments made during the meeting.

Item 15 - AOCB/Review of Papers Tabled

17. None and no action required. Papers Tabled presented in Appendix D

Item 16 - Next Meeting

18. The next meeting is planned for Monday 22nd August 2022 face to face.

Bennachie Community Council Insch Memorial Hospital - Integration Joint Board 1/6/22

1. Submissions to Board

Results of stakeholder group option appraisal

Ranking	Option No	Weighted benefit Score	Option
1	6	67.28	Inpatient beds in new build (in place of Insch WMH) including clinical services and wellbeing hub plus additional H&SC services in the community
2	4	63.77	Inpatient beds in a new build hospital or extension on the Insch WMH site, retain original building to provide a clinical space and wellbeing hub plus additional H&SC services in the community.
3	5	62.98	Inpatient beds in a new build (in place of existing Insch WMH) including clinical services plus additional H&SC services in the community.
4	3	54.08	Inpatient beds in a refurbished Insch WMH plus additional H&SC services in the community
5	8	50.54	Increase inpatient capacity at Inverurie Hospital with new build or extension, retain existing hospital building at Insch to provide a clinical space and a wellbeing hub plus developing additional H&SC services in the community
6	7c	47.51	Palliative and rehabilitation and enablement beds are provided elsewhere c) in other community hospitals in Aberdeenshire
7	7a	45.89	Palliative and rehabilitation and enablement beds are provided elsewhere a) in an alternative care setting in Insch
8	7b	45.34	Palliative and rehabilitation and enablement beds are provided elsewhere b) in an independent care home in the wider area.
9	1	41.23	Do Minimum- pre pandemic status quo- open Insch Hospital to inpatients as per the pre-Covid status
10	2	25.65	Do nothing – de facto status quo- Insch hospital remains closed and patients are admitted to other community hospitals in Aberdeenshire or ARI.

Columns 1-3 from report to IJB para 6.5, column 4 from para 6.3

Recommendations IJB report para 1.2

Consider the long list of options as scored by the stakeholder group at paragraph 6.5 and

- a) Note the highest scoring options involve a new build component for inpatient facilities and agree to the progression of further work and consultation on options 4,5,6 and 8 in order to produce a robust business case for submission to the Scottish Government to seek capital investment.
- b) Approve further development and consultation on creating a 'wellbeing hub' and clinical space within Insch War Memorial Hospital and additional health and social care services in the community, which can be provided within financial resources
- c) Agree to discount options 1,2 and 3 from further development; and
- d) Instruct officers to work with stakeholders to make arrangements for alternative inpatient facilities for Insch patients that can be achieved within existing budget provision, until such time as any new build facility is available.

Amendments proposed by Friends of Insch Hospital

Consider the long list of options as scored by the stakeholder group at paragraph 6.5 and:	
RECOMMENDATIONS IN THE REPORT	PROPOSED
Note the highest scoring options involve a new build component for inpatient facilities and agree to the progression of further work and consultation on options 4,5,6, and 8 in order to produce a robust business case for submission to the Scottish Government to seek capital investment	Note that the four highest scoring options all include inpatient beds on the Insch Hospital site, with the top three involving a new build component for inpatient facilities and agree to the progression of further work and consultation on options 4,5,and 6, in order to produce a robust business case for submission to the Scottish Government to seek capital investment
Approve further development and consultation on creating a 'wellbeing hub' and clinical space within Insch War Memorial Hospital and additional health and social care services in the community, which can be provided within existing financial resource.	Establish an Insch (and District) Service Planning Group to develop a local Service Plan, reflecting the identified health and social care priorities, building on the ideas and suggestions for service development and ways of working, that can be fully supported by all the Stakeholders
Agree to discount options 1,2, and 3 from further development;	Agree to discount options 1,2, 3 and 7a-c from further development as long-term options. Provide written clarity about the assessment of Option 3.
Instruct officers to work with stakeholders to make arrangements for alternative inpatient facilities for Insch patients that can be achieved within existing budget provision, until such time as any new build facility is available.	Instruct officers to work with the General Practice, Friends, and other stakeholders as a matter of urgency to make arrangements for inpatient facilities for Insch patients on the Insch Hospital site that can be achieved within existing budget provision, until such time as any new build facility is available.

2. IJB Meeting 1/6/22 Conclusions

The meeting accepted the recommendations as proposed: i.e.

- Further work on new builds for inpatient beds at either Insch or Inverurie
- No further work on options with in patient beds in existing Insch War Memorial Hospital building.
- Further work on re-designation the current Insch Hospital as a wellbeing hub.
- Immediate work in interim arrangements to provide alternatives for in -patient beds for patients from Insch area.

3. IJB Meeting 1/6/22 Process

The meeting was chaired by Rhona Atkinson of NHS Grampian. Four councillors participated and four other voting representatives of NHS Grampian were present.

The case was presented by Phillipa Jensen (Health & Social Care Manager) and Geraldine Fraser (Partnership Manager) supported by Pamela Milliken (Chief Officer) of Aberdeen Health and Social Care Partnership. Several other non-voting members of the IJB and NHS and Aberdeenshire officers were present.

Community Representatives Frank Musgrave (BCC) and Chris Humphries (FOIH) were allowed to talk for 10 minutes at the start of the agenda item. but were connected by telephone rather than joining the meeting by zoom and were muted after the allocated time to prevent them from contributing further, even to correct inaccuracies.

Councillors picked up on the point about promises made by members of the Scottish Government. However other members of the board emphasised that no priority should be given to Insch rather than other parts of Aberdeen and the indication was that the IJB might like to do a full inventory of capital expenditure requirements across Aberdeenshire before submitting any requests for capital allocation to the Scottish Government.

While discussion on Scottish Government funding was informative, unfortunately there was no acknowledgement of the points made by community representatives about current health care deficiencies in Insch. The stakeholder workgroup established that no risk assessment had been conducted on the impact on healthcare in the area of closing Insch Hospital. The stakeholder workgroup heard moving evidence that the difficulty in obtaining in-patient beds is resulting in inadequate health care in the Insch area.

Councillor Keating (Inverurie) proposed that further work on new builds be limited to an option in Insch. (option 4) There was no seconder.

Councillor Grant (W.Garioch) proposed that work on interim arrangements should specify in patient beds "in Insch". This amendment was defeated.

Before amendments were discussed and voted on the Chair indicated her preference to support the suite of recommendations as presented. The agenda item ended with the meeting voting to accept the recommendations as proposed.

4. IJB meeting 1/6/22 Reflections

It is ironic that this was the Integration Joint Board. The options developed by the stakeholder groups had the explicit intent of improving cooperative and seamless working between health and social care staff and to improve job satisfaction and staff retention. The "Integration Board" defaulted to "big hospital " mode.

While the bulk of the work had been done through a Stakeholders workgroup, the workgroup were not involved in the preparation of and did not have sight of the "final" report, the report considered by the IJB was not representative of the Stakeholder workgroup views.

The recommendations did not reflect the process initially outlined to the Stakeholders work group, which had been mandated by Healthcare Improvement Scotland.

Officers and Board members fell over themselves to emphasise how good the community consultation was, while at the same time riding roughshod over the community input. One member asserted that community input represented the "loudest voices" rather than measured profession input. The board was however keen to insist that community input was essential going forward both on interim arrangements and in developing the case for new build beds.

While promoting the benefits of consultation, the meeting were further not made aware that the stakeholders meeting acknowledged that the SNA report was not representative of community input.

A number of issues were mis-represented during the IJB meeting:

- It was stated that Insch patients are able to access beds in Inverurie or the Jubilee Hospital, Huntly. Evidence presented by the local medical practitioners suggests that this is not the case.
- It was stated that clinicians involved supported additional beds in Inverurie rather than Insch. That is completely incorrect. It was the clinicians which developed and promoted the options for beds in Insch. The relative scoring would have been different if that had been the case.
- It was stated that modifying Insch Hospital, even as an interim option, did not present value for money. Since the estates advice then went on to say that viability and cost would need to be determined via a design team this assertion is unsubstantiated. (FOIH had been trying to obtain this information from NHSG and also have different independent advice.)

5. Implications for Insch and district healthcare of IJB decision

- By default we now have the lowest ranked option for healthcare in Insch.
- Interim arrangements to replace in patient beds in the area are essential and urgent.
- The timescale for any new build is likely to be extended.

However:

- we still have the longer term option of a new build at Insch with in beds.
- Although the IJB would not commit to having the interim beds in Insch, this does not rule out the option of interim beds in Insch, for example in a modular building

6. Recommendations

1. Minute observations on the IJB process
2. Work with the Friends of Insch Hospital to understand the consequences of the IJB decision and to evaluate options moving forward.
3. When the Health and Social care partnership commence consultation on either the short term, interim arrangements or the new build options, BCC must engage with the consultation to represent the views of the community.

Annex B to
BCC Minutes
Dated 20 June 22



POLICE
SCOTLAND

Keeping people safe

POILEAS ALBA

No Police Report

Bennachie Community Council Planning Summary

June

Items distributed as per weekly lists via emails.

Bennachie Community Council Papers Tabled as of 20 June 2022

Police Reports

From Debbie Burnett (Debbie.Burnett@scotland.pnn.police.uk) / Gareth Hannan (Gareth.Hannan@scotland.pnn.police.uk) / Mark Irvine (mark.irvine@scotland.pnn.police.uk), Michael Urquhart (Michael.Urquhart@Scotlandpnn.police.uk) / Heather Nelson (North East CrimeReduction@Scotland.pnn.police.uk)
(12.06.22) Bennachie CC - Official

Planning

From Fraser Napier / Katie Cranwell / Hannah Gray / Calum Wright / Emma Furneaux / Jemma McBain (Aberdeenshire Council) & Adminhub (Adminhub.woodhill@aberdeenshire.gov.uk)
(20.06.22) 20 June 2022 – Weekly List - Garioch
(13.06.22) 13 June 2022 – Weekly List - Garioch
(06.06.22) 06 June 2022 – Weekly List - Garioch
(30.05.22) 30 May 2022 – Weekly List - Garioch

From Piers Blaxter (piers.blaxter@aberdeenshire.gov.uk)
(27.05.22) Aberdeenshire Local Development Plan 2027 – Community Council Engagement

From Timothy Xu (Timothy.Xu@aberdeenshire.gov.uk)
(14.06.22) APP/2022/1180

From Aurora Planning – Rothienorman
From Aurora Planning (maggie@auroraplanning.co.uk)
(09.06.22) Proposal of Application Notice – (Boundary Change)

Licensing

None received

Roads/Transport

Road Closures

From Elizabeth Ross (Elizabeth.ross@aberdeenshire.gov.uk) Elma Murray (elma.murray@aberdeenshire.gov.uk), Garioch Roads (Garioch.roads@aberdeenshire.gov.uk)
(20.06.22) For Information: Temporary Road Closure – B992 Gaitside Cottage – Old Rayne
(06.06.22) For Information: Temporary Road Closure – Commercial Road Inch
(06.06.22) For Information: Temporary Road Closure – C68s Largie
(24.06.22) For Information: Temporary Road Closure – C58c Rayne North

Aberdeen Airport

From Aberdeen Airport (airspace@aiairport.com)
(30.05.22) Next Steps for Aberdeen Airport's Airspace Change Proposal

A96 Dualling

From Garioch Area (garioch@aberdeenshire.gov.uk)
(25.05.22) Transport Scotland A96 Review Survey

A944 / A9119

From Madelyne Simpson (Madelyne.simpson2@aberdeenshire.gov.uk)
(20.06.22) A944 / A9119 Westhill to Aberdeen Multi-modal Transport Study – Engagement Opportunity

Aberdeenshire Council

From Alison Cumming (alison.cumming@aberdeenshire.gov.uk)
(31.05.22) Community Council Nominations

From Gemma Morrison (gemma.morrison@aberdeenshire.gov.uk)
(07.06.22) Garioch Area Service Contacts
(31.05.22) SCDC's Rebooting Resilience Webinar 09.06.2022

From Robert McKinney (Robert.mckinney@aberdeenshire.gov.uk)
(08.06.22) Trading Standards Scams Bulletin No. 47
(25.05.22) Trading Standards Scams Bulletin No. 46

From Caroline Smith (caroline.smith@aberdeenshire.gov.uk)
(17.06.22) Garioch Community Planning E Bulletin – 17 June 2022
(06.05.22) Garioch Focus on Funding and Support
(31.05.22) Investing in Communities Fund (ICF) Round 2 – Launch Date
(26.05.22) Garioch Focus on Funding and Support

From Susan Adams (susan.adams@aberdeenshire.gov.uk)
(01.06.22) Garioch Area Funding Page

Ward 10 Councillors

From Cllr Hazel Smith (Cllr. h.smith@aberdeenshire.gov.uk)
(11.06.22) Bennachie Community Council AGM Meeting Notice & Agenda - Apologies
(26.05.22) Bennachie Community Council Meetings

From Cllr Moray Grant (cllr.m.grant@aberdeenshire.gov.uk)
(20.06.22) Bennachie Community Council AGM Meeting Notice & Agenda - Apologies
(27.05.22) Bennachie Community Council Meetings
(27.05.22) Bennachie Community Council Meetings

From Cllr Sam Payne (cllr.s.payne@aberdeenshire.gov.uk)
(19.06.22) Bennachie Community Council AGM Meeting Notice & Agenda – 20th June 2022

BCC Business

Insch Hospital – IJB (emails forwarded from Frank Musgrave re Aberdeenshire Council – Alison McLeod (alison.mcleod4@aberdeenshire.gov.uk))

(27.05.22) IJB 1/6/22 Item 11 Request to Speak

Zoom Renewal

From Zoom (billing@zoom.us)

(14.06.22) Payment Processed for 5002846744 (Renewal Confirmation)

(07.06.22) Zoom Renewal Notification

Other Correspondence

NHS Grampian – It's Good to Share

From Vicky Ballantyne (Vicky.ballantyne@nhs.scot)

(10.06.22) 20220610 – It's Good to Share! - Grampian

NHS Share

From Sarah Ritchie (SRitchie001@dundee.ac.uk)

(06.06.22) NHS SGARE, The Scottish Health Research Register – Important Information

Friends of Inch of Hospital

From Jane Reid (janereidinsch@aol.com)

(17.06.22) Friends of Inch Hospital Mailing List – IJB Meeting

(01.06.22) Friends of Inch Hospital & Community: IJB Meeting

(25.04.22) Friends of Inch Hospital & Community SCIO Mailing List – Strawberry Fair and Centenary

Proposal for An Electric Trishaw

From Susan Lockhart (suslockhart@aol.com)

(16.06.22) A Proposal for An Electric Trishaw for Inch

(13.06.22) A Proposal for An Electric Trishaw for Inch

(07.06.22) A Proposal for An Electric Trishaw for Inch

Passivhaus Bill Consultation Launched

From Alex Rowley MSP (Alex.Rowley.msp@parliament.scot)

(01.06.22) Passivhaus Bill Consultation Launched – Please Share Your Views

Tour of Britain – Sunday 4th September 2022

From Sheila Stuart (Sheila.stuart@aberdeenshire.gov.uk)

(25.05.22) Tour of Britain Sunday 4 September 2022 – Initial Business Association and Community Council Engagement Letter

Forestry and Land Scotland – Community Strategy Consultation

From fls.communnunities@froestryandland.gov.scot

(10.06.22) Forestry and Land Scotland – Community Strategy Consultation